

**PLANNING COMMITTEE  
13 NOVEMBER 2018**

**17/P/0818/FUL – APPEAL AGAINST REFUSAL: DEMOLITION OF EXISTING BUNGALOW AND REPLACEMENT WITH NEW RESIDENTIAL PROPERTY - HILLCREST BUNGALOW, CEFN CRIB ROAD, PANTYGASSEG, TORFAEN**

Report Submitted by: Richard Lewis, Head of Planning and Development  
Report Written by: Sarah Hensby, Senior Planner

**Appeal Number:** APP/V6945/A/18/3204625

**Appeal Received;** 28<sup>th</sup> June 2018

**Appellant;** Mr Kevin Goff

**DECISION;** Appeal Dismissed 12<sup>th</sup> September 2018.



The application was refused under delegated powers on 20<sup>th</sup> December 2017, for the following reasons;

*The application site is located outside the urban boundary, as defined in the Adopted Torfaen Local Development Plan, where there is a presumption against new development unless it accords with national planning policy or where it constitutes an appropriate rural use which would not cause unacceptable harm to a countryside setting. In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority the extension of the residential curtilage which results from this proposal which includes significant engineering works outside its lawful boundaries constitutes an unacceptable urban intrusion into the countryside that is harmful to its special character and appearance, contrary to Policies S1, S2, S4, S4, S7 and C5 of the Adopted LDP*

*In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority the scheme for the replacement dwelling has not been submitted due to a functional need, the replacement dwelling extends well beyond the existing footprint and the replacement dwelling is materially larger than the existing dwelling and therefore contrary to Policy C5 criteria (a), (d) and (e) of the Adopted LDP*

*The application lacks supporting information to assess the necessary engineering operations and the impact on ecological and drainage matters*

In their decision, the Inspector confirmed the main issues were whether the proposal would accord with local policy relating to development in the open countryside, the visual impacts of the development and justified need for the replacement dwelling.

The Inspector noted that whilst not a traditional rural building, the modest scale and understated design of the existing bungalow allows it to assimilate within the wider landscape. The Inspector went on to explain that the proposed replacement dwelling would be substantially larger with the ridge height of the proposal's central gable section would be over twice that of the existing bungalow. The dwelling would also be far wider, extending well beyond the existing southern elevation. This substantial bulk would be readily apparent in views from Cefn Crib Road.

In addition the Inspector reported that the scale and design of the dwelling would urbanise the site, causing material harm to the rural character and appearance of the surrounding area. This harm would be amplified by the use of the adjoining field as a tended garden for the extended dwelling. The inspector considered that the use of materials to reflect those used in traditional local rural buildings would do little to mitigate the harmful visual impact. The inspector confirmed that the appeal must be determined on the basis of the plans that were submitted to the Council at the time of its decision and could not consider alternative locations.

The inspector agreed with the Local Planning Authority that the applicant had not demonstrated that there is any overriding functional need to replace the existing building rather than adapt it. The inspector considered that the impact on ecology and drainage matters could be addressed via planning conditions.

The Inspector concluded that the proposal would conflict with the spatial and sustainability objectives of LDP policies S1 and S2 and the design and landscape objectives of LDP policies S4, S7 and C5.

A copy of the Inspector's decision letter is attached.

Mrs Sarah Hensby

<b>Appendices</b>	None
<b>Background Papers</b>	<b>Note: Members of the public are entitled, under the Local Government Act 1972, to inspect background papers to reports. The following is a list of the background papers used in the production of this report</b>  Planning Application File: 17/P/0818/FUL

**For a copy of the background papers or for further information about this report, please telephone: Richard Lewis, Head of Development Management (Tel 01633 647628)**